

## Revealing the Invisible – Imagery of the Wind in the Religious Arts

Ryusaku Nagaoka

I have long devoted myself to the study of art history, and I’m more confident than ever that art is greatly significant to religion. In fact, art is much more important to religion than the reverse, and because of this I would never want to consider any art-related subject outside its religious context.

When I was invited to make a contribution to this book (which focuses on the theme of the imagery of wind), I decided to consider the possible religious significance of that theme. In religious art, we often find the representation of clothe fluttering in wind, so this is certainly an important motif. However, why is wind so prevalent in this kind of art? I believe that the answer to that should also concern religion.

In this paper, I’d like to turn once again to the religious role of wind. Then I will examine the role played by artworks that include representations of wind. In so doing, I hope to help stimulate the formation of a new perspective on religious art.

### 1. The history of research on wind imagery in Buddhist art

#### (1) Tadashi Inoue’s ideas and my spiritual resonance in a previous paper

I have spent a lot of time considering Buddhist statues and the ways they represent wind. This was motivated by the notion of the so-called Wu Daoxuan mode of certain statues (Wu Daoxuan, c. 685–758 or 689–759; also called Wu Daozi or Wu Tao Tzu), a concept that Tadashi Inoue had been discussing enthusiastically. Inoue coined the phrase “the expression of movement by wind” to describe the chief characteristic of the “Wu Daoxuan mode” statues.<sup>1</sup> Although this idea has not been referred to in subsequent art-historical considerations, there could be no more appropriate viewpoint for any consideration of the “imagery of wind” in religious art. Actually, Tadashi Inoue

---

All bibliographies of this chapter are written in Japanese or Chinese though the titles are translated into English.

1 Tadashi Inoue, “The Image of the Standing Eleven-headed *Kannon* of Hokke-ji Temple and Wu Daoxuan mode: Aspects of *Danzo* (sandalwood)-group statue 4,” *Gakuso*, no. 9 (1987).

was one of the pioneers in relating Buddhist statues to the imagery of wind.

Basing his interpretations of the information about Wu Daoxuan (Wu Daozi) presented in the *Lidai Minghua Ji (Famous Paintings through History)* and in other Chinese painting historiographies and theories, Inoue characterized his style as follows: Wu Daoxuan devised the “expression of movement by wind,” a quality that makes beholders feel the *qui* inherent within the subjects, and in doing so he favored *xie-yi* (grasping the inner meaning) over *xing si* (imitating the outer likeness). He tried to achieve this in realistic depictions, employing ancient Chinese features of expression, like pointed tips on robes, as well as celestial robes or edges of robes that sweep backward. Inoue referred to this method as “Wu Daoxuan’s style” as well as “Wu Daoxuan’s painting style” (that is, the “Wu Daoxuan mode”), and he identified the “expression of movement by wind” as the indicator of this style. Then he showed a particular *hakubyozuzou* (an uncolored drawing of a Buddhism image) in Japan<sup>2</sup> as an example of an image that conveys the Wu Daoxuan style. In the drawing he focused on the clothes moving dynamically, and there he identified a feature of the Wu Daoxuan style, including part of drawing lines and drapery ones of clothes. He realized that these weren’t depictions of natural wind but expressions of the *qui* inherent in the subject. Inoue’s theory is unique in that he identifies the expression of movement by wind (seen in the robes of Buddhist statues) as the hallmark of the style of Wu Daoxuan and in that he recognizes the expression of *qui* as the motive for this style.

Later I examined Tadashi Inoue’s theory and found that the expression “XX mode” (as in the “Wu Daoxuan mode”) means “pattern” and shouldn’t be understood as referring precisely to a style; that the expression “XX mode” can be used to link multiple works if they’re understood as representing a like “pattern” of this kind; and that such “XX modes” have been conveyed through a lot of pictorial media.<sup>3</sup> In this paper (hereinafter referred to as the “previous paper”), I attempted to critically examine Inoue’s interpretation of the notion of the Wu Daoxuan mode.

However, it wasn’t possible to properly investigate another axis of Inoue’s theory, the interpretation of the “expression of dynamic movement” or the “Wu Daoxuan mode” as an expression of *qui*. For that reason, I concluded the previous paper as follows. Although the passages are somewhat lengthy, I will quote the relevant portions to clarify my current viewpoint. Any

---

2 Ink painting of Bodhisattva on linen (Shosoin Treasure), Gumonjiho Konponson-Zuzo (Daigo-ji Temple), illustrations of *Zuigu Darani Shinju Sutra* (Calligraphy Museum), Nio Sutra Goho Shoson-zu, 5 pieces (Daigo-ji Temple), Shishu Goma Honzon Kenzoku Zuzo (Daigo-ji Temple), Door paintings of Miniature Shrine (Todai-ji Kaidan-in), and Soshitennō Zukan, attributed to Wu Daoxuan (Osaka City Museum of Art).

3 Ryusaku Nagaoka, “‘Kata’ in Buddhist statue expression and its propagation: A study of bodhisattva-shaped sculptures in the early Heian period” (vols. 1 and 2), *Bijutsu Kenkyū (Art Study)*, no. 351 and no. 352 (1992).

additional information has been supplemented in [ ].

Next, regarding the meaning of the kinetic representation of clothing (clothing that flutters in the wind), Kazutoshi Inoue considered it an expression of intrinsic *qui*. There is no doubt that *qui* is traditionally the central principle of the Chinese plastic arts, but in interpreting such representations it is not adequate to consider all expressions of *qui* in the same manner. For example, the fluttering heavenly garments of *Hiten* and *Tenbu* are clearly symbols of their kinetic nature and are thought to be linked to the kinetic nature of the body itself. In particular, in the Hokke-ji Temple statue, the movement of the garments accords with the context of the statue as a whole, since the body itself is also recognized to be in motion. Likewise, in the statues of Hokke-ji Temple [The Eleven-headed *Kannon* statue (*Shíyīmiàn Guānyīn, ekadaśamukha*)] [Fig. 1] and Daigo-ji Temple [*Kokūzō Bosatsu, (Xūkōngzàng Púsà, Ākāśagarbha)*] [Fig. 2] the clear intent is to suggest that the wind blowing from the front causes the realistic movement of the robes. In other words, we can recognize a more realistic context that includes the inevitability of movement, and therefore we cannot say that this is merely a representation based on “intrinsic *qui*.” Indeed, we do not have any concrete answer as to why such movement was intended. However, the description of the fluttering heavenly garment in (for example) the second parable of the *Myōhō Rengekyō* (the *Saddharma-Puṇḍarīka Sūtra*, translated by Kumārajīva (344?–413?)) — “the heavenly garment flutters in the empty space where it resides, and it turns and rotates around itself” — and the sixth discretion — the garments of the heavenly bodies are a thousand million billion, and they turn and turn and then come back down — indicate that the garments have significance as ornaments in the Buddhist realm, so we should consider their significance from a dogmatic viewpoint. Regarding the kinetic representation of the Hokke-ji image, Inoue has already interpreted it in relation to liturgical prayer,<sup>4</sup> and we look forward to further developments in his research.

The fact that the kinetic representations of garments are mainly found in the so-called *Danzo* (sandalwood) and *Meliaceae* (mahogany) statues provokes thought about the contours of the concept of *Danzo* statues. The important characteristic of these statues is the absolute authority generated by their exoticism and legacy, both of which remind one of the lands where Buddhism originated. This authority emerges both in the “Indian” appearance of the

---

4 Kazutoshi Inoue, “On the Expression of the Eleven-headed *Kannon*,” Open Lecture of the Department of Art and Archives, National Research Institute for Cultural Properties, Tokyo, 1988. It was published as follows: Kazutoshi Inoue, “On the Expression of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* -its development in Japan,” *Silk Road Studies* 11 (2001): 5.

Eleven-headed *Kannon* statue at the Tokyo National Museum and in the example of Meliaceae *Shakya Zui-zo*. In Japan these dynamic garments may have been used to express the exoticism or transcendence that was to be incorporated into the *bodhisattva* images when these images were rendered as *Danzo* statues. In Japan exoticism has always been understood in Chinese and Indian terms. Just as “Cao family mode” (“Cao Zhongda (c. 3rd quarter of 6th century) mode” in the *Toga-Kenmonshi* ; *Tú huà jiàn wén zhì* ) clearly embodies the Indian mode seen in the Seiryu-ji Temple statue, “Wu family mode” (“Wu Daoxuan mode “in the *Toga-Kenmonshi*) is associated with the Chinese mode. I would like to suggest that both modes were exemplified in Japan, especially in *Danzo*-mode works.

On the other hand, the fact that in the Hokke-ji and Daigo-ji statues the “Wu family mode” is accurately incorporated into the unified context of the statues as a whole (i.e., their dynamic representations) indicates that the environments in which the statues were created had to be places where dynamic force was present and that that environments did much to determine the expression apparent in the statues.

The discussion in this paper is a kind of introduction to the production of Buddhist statues, not an examination of the specific circumstances of each statue. It is necessary to reconsider the individual context in which each statue was created and the environment in which the phenomena under discussion emerged. These issues will be discussed in the future and will be discussed in another article.

This passage points out the framework and limitations of the author’s thinking at the time when he was writing the previous article. First of all, the author did not directly examine the expression of *qui*, which Inoue considers to be the motive for the establishment of the “Wu Daoxuan mode.” This is simply because he was not prepared to examine it. Secondly, he considers the “movement of clothing” as a pattern and tries to discuss it within the scope of a propagating pattern. This is because he was stuck in the framework which holds that art history should be concerned with the propagation of forms. Therefore, he is not sufficiently committed to discussing the movement itself. Finally, the passage also attempts to answer the question of how dynamic expressions are recognized in *Danzo* statues and does so by taking the viewpoint of the symbolism of the forms. Consideration of the individual circumstances of the statues in which motion is observed is left to a later discussion.

Thus, in the previous article the author paid attention to the relationship between Buddhist statues and wind — or the expression of motion and stillness found in Buddhist statues — but did not go into the question of why wind is expressed in these statues. When the manuscript for

that article was written, Buddhist statues were for the author merely materials for art history that represented the transmission and rebirth of forms.

It is not clear from his article how Tadashi Inoue came to focus on *qui*, but thinking that wind is expressed to convey the existence of *qui* is to regard wind as something that conveys an invisible existence. Professor Inoue was a scholar who realized early the religious significance of wind. By contrast, the author was previously unable to learn from Tadashi's conception.

## (2) Wu Daozi's Expression of Wind

Tadashi Inoue's interpretation is that Wu Daoxuan (Wu Daozi) invented "wind movement expression" as an expression that makes the viewer feel the *qui* inherent in the subject. The problem here is the concept of *qui* that is inherent in the subject.

*Qui* is an ancient Chinese concept that refers to "the source material from which all things, including human beings, originate, or the minutest elements that form each of the things that originate."<sup>5</sup> Although *qui* is invisible, it appears as "weather." In the case of human beings, "the state of our inner *qui* appears as a form on the outer surface."<sup>6</sup> This indicates that *qui* itself has nothing to do with wind.

It is well known that Zhang Yanyuan (815?-76)<sup>7</sup> quoted and commented on Xie He's "Six Elements That Define a Painting" in his *Lidai Minghua Ji (Famous Paintings through History)*. The six elements that define a painting, as explained by Bunri Usami,<sup>8</sup> are *qiyun shengdong* (spirit resonance), *gufa yongbi* (the way of using the brush), *yingwu xiangxing* (the depicting of form), *suilei fusai* (the application of color), *jingying weizhi* (placing and arrangement), and *chuanyi moxie* (the copying of models). Of these the most important is *qiyun shengdong*. Zhang Yanyuan praises Wu Daozi as a painter who exemplifies all of the six elements of painting.

The *Famous Paintings through History* specifically describes Wu Daozi's expression in the following passage from Volume II, "Discussing the Brushes of Gu, Lu, Zhang, and Wu": "The long, curled whiskers and long hair at the sideburns fly several feet in the air, and the roots of the hair emerge from the flesh, giving the painting a full sense of power and dynamism." The author goes on to transmit the painted dynamic motion by writing the above cited sentences. And then the citation continues that "wonderful greatness, and concrete persuasive in depiction of skins and

---

5 *Iwanami Buddhist Dictionary* (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1989).

6 Bunri Usami, *Collection of historical fine arts-Art theory on Qui* (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 2010).

7 Yu Anran, ed., *Art History Series 1* (Chinese) (Shanghai: the Shanghai People's Fine Arts Publishing House, 1963); *Famous Paintings through History*, trans. and annotated by Toshio Nagahiro, Toyo Bunko 305 (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1982).

8 Usami, *Collection*.

veins exceeds that of Sengyou, “Such comparison of Wu with Zhang Sengyou is probably due to the similarities in the ways these artists used the brush, as in a passage that “Zhang and Wu’s paintings all have only one or two strokes, but their images are more realistic” (vol. 2). Zhang Yanyuan (first half of 6th century) sees Wu’s brush strokes as being quick and realistic, with a sense of movement and power.

Other works that are from the same period as the *Famous Paintings through History* and that mention Wu Daozi’s expression are the *Ji Tappa Ki (Record of Temples and Tours; late Tang Dynasty: Dan Cheng Shiki (c. 803–c. 63), 7th year of Dazhong (853))*<sup>9</sup> and the *Tang-chao-ming-hua-lu (The Collection of Fine Paintings from the Tang Dynasty)* (Late Tang Dynasty: Zhu Jing Xuan (806–40)).<sup>10</sup> In a section of the *Ji Tappa Ki* describing Wu Daozi’s wall paintings at Bodhi Temple in Pinggangbang, it is written that “on the front or north wall of the inner chamber, Wu Daoxuan depicted a poem in verse of *Chidoron*. The way of lines is Wu’s creation. His calligraphy is so strong and the hair of a demon god is like a crucifix. The next portion depicts a hermit bowing towards his bones. The heavenly robe is depicted as flying out, covering the wall and moving with the wind.” The “hair like a crucifix” refers to the way the hair flutters out, and the “heavenly robe flying out, covering the wall, and moving with the wind” clearly describes the flying heavenly robe in Wu Daozi’s painting. In his article on Jinggong Temple, Duan Chengshi wrote a stanza titled “Wu’s Painting,” in which he says, “Among ten miserable moments, Wu’s painting is like a crazy trail. The winds and clouds are about to tighten on people, and the demon gods are about to break free from the wall.” In this passage, Duan focuses on the violent movement of the winds and clouds and the verisimilitude of the scene in which they seem to break free from the wall. The *Collection of Fine Paintings from the Tang Dynasty* says, “Five dragons are painted on the walls of inner hall, and their scales and armors seem to be flying and moving,” saying the flying movement of Wu Daozi. In addition, it refers to the diversity of Wu Daozi’s depictions of people, citing the *Ryokyo Kikyū Den (Biographies from both capital cities)*, which states, “The figures depicted on the walls of the temple are in more than three hundred with various facial expressions and gestures, and no two are the same.”

Du Fu (712–70), who saw the Painting of Five Saints at the mausoleum of Laojun in Luòyáng painted by Wu Daozi in the 8th year of Thian-pó (749), wrote a verse titled as “On a winter day,

---

9 *Si ta ji. yizhou minghua lu. yuandai huasu ji (Records of Temples and Pagodas, Collection of Fine Arts in Yizhou, Collection of paintings and sculptures in the Yuan dynasty)* (Chinese), Chinese Art Essays Series (Shanghai: the Shanghai People’s Fine Arts Publishing House, 1963).

10 Yu Anlan, ed., *A Collection of Paintings* (Chinese) (Shanghai: Shanghai People’s Fine Art Publishing House, 1982).

I visited the mausoleum of Emperor Xuanzong (Laozi, 571BC?–471BC?) which is located in the north of the city Luòyáng, where the Paintings of Five Saints could be seen on the walls.” In a stanza, the poet wrote “Looking at the painting, the subjects happen far away from the place where Wu Daozi works. He transferred the base of the forest and the earth, and the exquisite fences of the palace. Five saints and five robes are linked up, and a thousand officials are lined up in a shape of flying wild geese. The thread ornaments of crowns, flags, and flagpoles all fly up and down” (Du Koubu Shu).<sup>11</sup> The phrase “ flags, and flagpoles all fly up and down” refers to the sight of the flags hoisted during the procession, fluttering in the wind, and is also a reference to the dynamic flying nature of Wu Daozi’s paintings.

Thus, Wu Daozi’s paintings are considered to be full of expressions of wind-driven movements. Zhang Yanyuan recognized Wu Daozi as a painter who had mastered the six basic principles of painting (above mentioned, the six elements that define a painting), including the most difficult of them, *qiyun shengdong*. If so, the dynamic flying expression would have contributed to the evaluation that he had attained *qiyun shengdong*. In that sense, it would have been the perception that what was depicted was lively.

The subjects of Wu Daozi’s Buddhist paintings, which are demonstrated in historical materials, are characterized by the fact that many of them depict heavenly bodies, which are described as deities or demi-gods and are lower in the Buddhist hierarchy, in particular.<sup>12</sup> It can be seen that the expression “flying” was more likely to be used for the lower heavenly deities, which are equipped with many wind-swept parts.

In “Reporting Teachers, Teachings, North and South, Ages” in the Famous Paintings through History vol. 2, Zhang Yanyuan wrote, “Kin Chiyoku has Cao as his teacher. Cao creates Buddhist matters. There are of Cao family, Zhang family, and Wu family in painting modes of Buddha,” clearly pointing out the three modes in Buddhist painting. Thus, it is certain that Wu Daozi’s expression is considered a “pattern” as described in my previous article.

Now, if we consider the “Wu Family mode” as a “pattern” of Buddhist painting, it is considered to have the characteristics of Wu Daozi’s paintings as described above. First; the expression should have strongly dynamic flying nature, second; it should be realistic and verisimilitude, and third; it should be of relatively low-ranked deities, easily showing dynamic motion, and mainly clothed in heavenly garments to show dynamic movement. If these conditions are reflected in the form of “pattern,” then the first and third points are particularly important. It is

---

11 Recompiled in *Du Shaoling* collection (Chinese): Misao Saku, ed., *A Comprehensive View of Chinese Poetry* (1936).

12 Appendix to Nagaoka, “‘Kata’ in Buddhist statues,”: “List of Wu Daozi’s Traces”.

thought that the “pattern” of the Buddha image “Wu Family mode” was recognized through this process. “Wu Family mode” can be understood as a representation of the lower deities below the Bodhisattvas, who have robes that should fly and flutter.

Wu Daizi’s expression became the “pattern” of the Buddhist expression “Wu Family mode”. However, Zhang Yanyuan does not mention the role of the wind image “Wu Family mode”. It goes without saying that merely recognizing the existence of the “pattern” does not answer the theme of this paper, which is what is the image of the wind. What is most important in considering religious art is to know in which context this “pattern” was used.

## 2. Wind as auspicious manifestations of Buddha

### (1) Wind at the *Renshou* Stupa — performing the spiritual resonance

Since the previous article, the author’s interests have expanded. Therefore, the issue of the relation Buddhism statues and wind can be re-discussed along with his subsequent concerns. An important keyword in the perspective acquired since then is “spiritual resonance”. “Spiritual resonance” refers to the miraculous events by which superior beings performs to human approach. The approach from the human being is called “spiritual appeal” and the answer from the superior beings is called “resonance”,

A good material for the discussion of “spiritual resonance” would be given by the project that is generally known as the *Renshou* Relic-Distribution Campaign, in which the Sui Emperor Wen (541–604, reign: 581–604) constructed stupas in more than a hundred provinces throughout China three times around; the first (601), the second (602), and the fourth (604) years of *Renshou*.<sup>13</sup>

---

13 My previously published articles on the *Renshou* Stūpas are as follows. Ryusaku Nagaoka, “The Reliquary Vessels from Sui and Tang Dynasties: On the Transformation of Form and Meaning,” in *Research Report of the Silk Road Research Center* 21(2004); Ryusaku Nagaoka, “*Reigen* (auspicious manifestations) in Buddhism: The Place and Representation of the Buddha’s Reception,” *Journal of Mortality and Life Studies* 12 (2009); Ryusaku Nagaoka, “The Origin of the *Renshou* Stūpas: Its Location and Significance,” in *Studies on the faiths and decoration in the Sui and Tang Dynasties*, Research Report of Kakenhi (Grants-in-Aid for Scientific Research (B), JSPS, Chief researcher: Masaru Kajima) (2012); Ryusaku Nagaoka, “*Renshou* Stūpas from Sui Dynasty and Remains of the Shengfu Temple in Qingzhou,” in *Study of Buddhist Stone Cuttings in the Medieval China* (Tokyo: Bensei Shuppan, 2013); Ryusaku Nagaoka, “The Stone Coffin of *Renshou* Stupas and Spiritual resonance,” in *Studies on the faiths and decoration in the Sui and Tang Dynasties*, Research Report of Kakenhi (Grants-in-Aid for Scientific Research (B), JSPS, Chief researcher: Masaru Kajima) (2016); Ryusaku Nagaoka, “Spiritual Resonance and Image — the Representative Form and Thought seen in the *Renshou* Stūpas,” in *Essays on Asian Buddhist Art: East Asia II*, Sui and Tang Dynasties, (Tokyo: Chuokoron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2019); Ryusaku Nagaoka, *Buddhism and Formation: Art History from the Viewpoint of Faith*, Part I, Chapter 1 (Chuokoron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2021),

On June 13 of the first year of *Renshou*, Emperor Wen issued the “Decree for the construction of pagodas in the land of Sui” (*Kô gummyô-shû*, vol. 17: Virtues of Buddha, no. 3–3)<sup>14</sup> for the 601 campaign. The construction of the pagoda and the subsequent rituals caused miracles all over the country. The *Kô gummyô-shû* vol. 17 reports on these miracles by citing *Shari kannô-ki* (Sheli ganying ji; A record of the spiritual resonance of the Buddha’s relics) compiled by Wang Shao (Sui period) for the first campaign<sup>15</sup>, and *Kei shari kannô hyô narabini tô* (Qing sheli ganying biao bing da; The rejoicing spiritual resonance of the Buddha relics, their appearances and responses) compiled by Andewang Xióng (540–612), et al. for the second campaign.<sup>16</sup> The reason why miracles are reported is that miracles are meant to indicate the Buddha’s “spiritual resonance” evoked by the act of respectfully burying the *sarira*. For the time being, we can see whether wind was also considered as a Buddha’s spiritual resonance by checking whether “wind” is mentioned in both above mentioned texts.

First, the following examples can be found in the *Shari kannô-ki*.

- a) At Qīyán Temple in Pu province, when the Buddhists carried the *sarira* in a palanquin up a mountain, a great wind blew from below, and the force of the wind brought them to the Temple in a short time.<sup>17</sup>
- b) At Dìngjué Temple in Zheng province, when the Buddhists put the *sarira* in a box, the banners hanging on the four sides of the Temple turned inward at one time even though there was no wind.<sup>18</sup>
- c) When a stupa was constructed at Dàyǔ Temple in Wú province, the *sarira* crossed over the river about five times, but there were no waves by wind.<sup>19</sup>
- d) When Shāmén erected a stupa at Héngyuè Temple in Heng province, he accompanied the *sarira* on the 8,000-plus-kilo meter journey on water from Jiānglíng. Four times a headwind blew, but when he asked the wind to calm down, it did so, and he begged for a favorable wind four times.<sup>20</sup>

In addition, the following examples are found in the *Kei shari kannô hyô narabini tô*.

---

14 *Taishōzō* (Tokyo: Daizōshuppan, 2002), 52–213.

15 *Taishōzō* 52–213–16.

16 *Taishōzō* 52–216–20.

17 *Taishōzō* 52–214c.

18 *Taishōzō* 52–215b.

19 *Taishōzō* 52–216a.

20 *Taishōzō* 52–216a.

e) When the Buddhists constructed a stupa at Dàxingshàn Temple in Xi'an, they left the *sarira* in the *Shosoto-do* Hall first and departed on the morning of December 2. At this time, the sky was clear, the air was calm, and the wind was still.<sup>21</sup>

f) When the Buddhists dug the ground to erect a stupa at Lóngcáng Temple in Héng province, the wind blew from the south, and the fragrance inside the temple was particularly different and incomparable.<sup>22</sup>

g) When the *sarira* was offered to Hàn wáng Temple in Luò Province, the fragrance suddenly came down. It was unprecedented. Later, the eastern wind suddenly arose and extinguished the flame of a lamp, then the divine light arose to the southeast of the Temple and lit the lamp. The incense wind blew again.<sup>23</sup>

(h) In the Rénjué Temple of Yōng Province, the wind blew from the southwest, and the incense air became thick and very fragrant.<sup>24</sup>

From above mentioned examples, we can confirm the phenomena in which the wind was showing spiritual resonance in the *Renshou* Relic-Distribution Campaign. The context can be summarized as follows.

- ① Wind carries people and boats (a, d)
- ② Banners sway even though there is no wind (b)
- ③ No obstructive wind occurs (c, e)
- ④ Carry fragrance (f, g, h)
- ⑤ Extinguishing a light (g)

Here, we can see clearly how people in the Sui dynasty perceived the wind. From ① we can see the meaning of “wind that helps moving,” from ③ “wind that becomes an obstacle,” and from ④ “wind that carries fragrance. From ② and ⑤, it can be seen that the banners and the flames are the medium through which wind is perceived, respectively. In this case, wind is something to be seen, not felt.

In the context of the spiritual resonance perception of the *Renshou* Relic-Distribution Campaign, wind is perceived in these ways. How, then, was the wind represented in art at this time?

---

21 *Taishōzō* 52–217a.

22 *Taishōzō* 52–217b.

23 *Taishōzō* 52–219b.

24 *Taishōzō* 52–219c.

There is only one known artifact among the *Renshou* stupas that involves visual representations. This is seen on the stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple. It was from the stupa, which was erected at the Temple of Yījūn prefecture, Yí province (now Shaanxi/Sensi) in the 4th year of *Renshou* (604) from the third campaign. It was discovered in April 1969 at the site of the Temple, and now put in the front yard of the Yao County Museum.

The stone coffin, which consists of a body and lid, has elaborate designs engraved on the entire top and sides. I have once discussed the meaning and role of this design in one of my previous articles,<sup>25</sup> in which I suggested that the design on the stone coffin was meant to represent the auspiciousness that appeared on the surface of the coffin due to the spiritual resonance of the *sarira*. The stone coffin containing the *sarira* is the medium through which the *sarira*'s resonance is conveyed, and the design shows the concrete aspects of the *sarira*'s spiritual resonance. The stone coffin functions as a medium that conveys the invisible holiness of the *sarira* to human beings.

The four sides of the lid's risers [Figs. 3-6] clearly show the design of wind. Two heavenly figures are respectively depicted flying from each side. The heavenly robes worn by them are blown strongly by the wind, stretching long. The left celestial figure on the east side bends its right leg and stretches its left leg to make a sudden brake, while the right celestial figure on the west side bends its body and flies backward. Their images have full sense of speeds and lively movements. The heavenly garments, blown strongly by the wind, emphasize the sense of speed of the flying heavenly figures.

As the heavenly figures on the right of the east side are offering lotus flowers, and the two heavenly figures on the south and north sides are offering lotus flowers and *hua-ban* (a plate of flowers), it is clear that these heavenly figures are first and foremost flying to make offerings to the *sarira*. In addition, the two heavenly figures on the north side are both in mournful poses,<sup>26</sup> which also implies that they are mourning the death of *Sakyamuni*. The twofold good deeds for the Buddha, lotus offering and mourning, are represented here. The Buddhist meaning of "lotus offering" and the Confucian meaning of "mourning" can be interpreted as twofold good deeds for the Buddha. The expression of wind is used here to bring in the image of rushing to the funeral. Since the design of the stone coffin shows the concrete phase of spiritual resonance of the *sarira*, the flying of the heavenly figures itself contains the meaning of the spiritual resonance of the *sarira*.

---

25 Nagaoka, "Spiritual resonance and Image."

26 Takeo Izumi, "The iconography and characteristics of a stone coffin from Shéndé Temple", *Studies on the faiths and decoration in the Sui and Tang Dynasties*, Research Report of Kakenhi (Grants-in-Aid for Scientific Research (B), JSPS, Chief researcher: Masaru Kajima) (2012).

The flying movement of the clothes plays an effective role in showing this meaning.

Next, the four faces of the body of the stone coffin should also be examined. First, on the south face [Fig. 7], there is at the center a large container surrounded by five jewel balls on a lotus seat. This appears to be the reliquary. On either side, Vajradhara's and two beasts (with both lion and bird footed) are arranged. The left Vajradhara bends his right arm, clenches his fist, and holds it against his chest, while his left hand is extended downward and his palm is outstretched. The right Vajradhara has one arm flexed loosely and another arm flexed tightly, both fists clenched, looking up to the heavens. The left deity beats his chest with his fist, while the right one looks up to the heavens in wailing and lamentation. The garments and crowns worn by these two deities, who are deeply grieving over the death of *Sakyamuni* Buddha in front of his remains in the reliquary, are being blown strongly by the wind. The flying robes seem to be linked to the deep grief of Vajradharas. The expression of the wind seems to have the function of reflecting their emotions.

The north face [Fig. 8] shows a jewel ball in the center. The two *Bhikṣu*'s on either side of it can be identified from the titles attached to them as, from left to right: *Śāriputra*, *Ānanda*, *Mahākāśyapa*, and *Maudgalyāyana*. They are wailing in their respective poses. However, their clothes do not flutter in the wind.

On the south and north faces, there are two trees on both ends of the background and water waves in the foreground. These can be taken to represent the bank of *Batsudaiga* river and the *Sāla* tree. In other words, these indicate the scene of *nirvana*, but where the Buddha should lie down, there is a jewel ball and the reliquary of *sarira*. In other words, a jewel ball and the reliquary symbolize the Buddha, and the people who are deeply grieving and mourning his death (Vajradhara's and *Bhikṣu*'s) are placed beside them.

On the east and west faces [Figs. 9 and 10], each two of the Four Heavenly Kings are shown on each face with a container in the center. On the east face, the Eastern *Dhṛtarāṣṭra* is on the left and the Southern *Virūdhaka* on the right, and on the west face, the Western *Virūpākṣa* on the left and the Northern *Vaiśravaṇa* on the right. These four heavenly deities do not show any expression of sorrow, nor do their heavenly robes flutter in the wind.

On the four faces of the body of coffin, only *Vajradharas*' robes are tossed in the wind. This fits within the scope of "Wu family mode," which is said to be adapted to subordinate deities, but this stone coffin, produced in 604, dates from before the appearance of Wu Daozi and has no relation to "Wu family mode." Even so, it can be seen as an expression of *qiyun shengdong* in the sense that it visualizes the deep sorrows of the *Vajradharas*. Since the design of the stone coffin is clearly intended, the flying robe there would be an appropriate material to consider its meaning.

(2) Wind seen in Buddhist statues - signaling "auspicious spiritual resonance"

Garments caught by wind are often depicted in *Danzo* statues. A representative example is the statue of the Standing Eleven-headed *Kannon* of Hokke-ji Temple [Fig. 1]. The heavenly robe lightly pinched with the right-hand and hanging down from the left-hand flutters lightly as if blown by the wind from below. The copper plates cut-out hair attached to both sides of the head gently flutter in the wind blowing from the front, and the skirt is attached to the leg shins. A big step forwards of the right foot shows the movement of the body, which expresses a clear dynamic motion.

Tadashi Inoue considers this as an expression of *qui* derived from Wu Daozi of the Sheng Tang dynasty. Since Wu Daozi's expression became a "pattern" of Buddhist painting expression called "Wu family mode," it is certainly possible that "Wu family mode" has extended to *Danzo* statues. However, the expression of wind must be understood in conjunction with its context. In this case, in what context is wind expressed in Buddhist statues? Is it a manifestation of *qui*? However, since *qui* is not itself related to wind, we cannot unconditionally apply this view to Buddhist statues. Therefore, next, I would like to consider the relationship between wind and Buddhist statues from the perspective of *Danzo*.

The author has already discussed the nature and role of *Danzo* statues in the ritual of "repentance".<sup>27</sup> The "repentance" is a ritual in which repentance or incantation (*darani*) is offered to a specific deity, and the repentance offered to the Eleven-headed *Kannon* is called the Eleven-headed repentance. The following is a summary of this issues we have examined.

- a) The Eleven-headed *Kannon* image is a device to receive the effects of *darani*.
- b) The *Kannon Danzo* is a medium that conveys the "auspicious spiritual resonance" of the Buddha to human beings.
- c) The "auspicious spiritual resonance" is attended by the movement and utterance of the statue.

Each of these characteristics of *Danzo* has its source in *sutra* texts.

First of all, regarding the point a), the *Juichimen Shinju Shingyo* (*Eleven-headed Kannon Incantation Mind Sutra*) states, "If you wish to realize the incantation, first carve a block of solid, unbroken white Indian sandalwood to make a statue of *Avalokitesvara*,"<sup>28</sup> and it is based on the

---

27 Ryusaku Nagaoka, "Repentance and Buddhist Statues," *Rokuonzōshū* 8 (2006), which is subsequently compiled into Nagaoka, *Buddhism and Formation*, Part III, Chapter 2.

28 Taishōzō 20–152. The transcription here is based on *Shin-kokuyaku Daizo Kyō 12, Esoteric Buddhism 2* (Tokyo: Daizōshuppan, 2002).

belief that making a statue of *Kannon* using *Danboku* wood, including sandalwood, will bring about the “realization of a divine incantation”. Incantation is synonymous with *darani*. Here, the nature of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* as an esoteric deity is emphasized, and therefore, the *Danzo* image of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* is made in order to realize the effect of *darani*.

The second source for the point b) is a passage from the *Juichimen Shinju Shingyo Ghiso* (the commentary on the *Eleven-headed Kannon Incantation Mind Sutra* (Tang, Selections by Huizhǎo, hereafter referred to as *Ghiso*), which states, “If the statue of *Avalokiteśvara* is always made of sandalwood, it will manifest the “auspicious spiritual resonance”.<sup>29</sup> This statement comes after the famous passage that explains the rationale for the using sandalwood for such statues, where it also says that if sandalwood is not available, then the statue should be made of *Kashiwa* wood as a substitution of *Danboku*. The reason for using sandalwood is that it is the prerequisite condition for *Kannon* to manifest “auspicious spiritual resonance”. Therefore, a *Danzo* statue of *Kannon* is the medium that conveys “auspicious spiritual resonance” to human beings.

Then, what is “auspicious spiritual resonance”? The answer to this question would be given by c), which is based on the following passage from the *Eleven-headed Kannon Incantation Mind Sutra*.

“If you wish to make this statue and pray it, you must put on and receive the new robe of purity and comply the precepts. Recite this incantation at three o’clock every day from the first day of the white moon (between the first and fifteenth day of each month) to the eighth day, reaching one hundred eight times, or forever (omitting between). At that time, the earth will tremble and shake, and the body of the statue will also move, and a voice will emanate from its mouth of the face, praising the ascetic and saying, “Good, good, good person, you have done well to appeal and pray as you have done. I must hear your desire. Let thou soar into the sky and be gone. Or let your playground be unhindered. Or make thyself a king among hermits, or make thyself free and unhindered as I am.”

*Ghiso* interprets the “auspicious spiritual resonance” as the signs of divine presence, which are the movement and utterance of the statue. And it questions “what is the reason for the statue to move and emit the voice, even if the wood has no mind,” and gives three reasons as follows. The first is “because the ascetic’s heart is sincere,” the second is “because the ascetic’s desire is so strong,” and the third is “because the *Bodhisattva*’s desire is heavy. In other words, the role of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* statue made of white sandalwood is to move and speak in resonance to the

---

29 Taishōzō 39–1004.

spiritual sincerity of the ascetic's "heart" and the strength of his "desire," and to convey the ascetic that the power of his petition itself was realized. In other words, *Kannon* expresses his "*shirushi* (signs)" in resonance to the ascetic's spiritual action.

It is little unreasonable to assume that the curvature of the tips of the hands and feet of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* statue of Hokke-ji Temple corresponds to the ideology of this sutra. If it is the case, then the wind in the hair and robe can also be regarded as an expression to show that the statue is moving. The wind acts to convey that *Kannon* has resonated to the petition. In connection with this interpretation, Kazutoshi Inoue has interpreted the "movements" often reported of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* statues as signs of *Kannon's* coming.<sup>30</sup> The understanding that the image signals the coming of *Kannon* also leads to the similar view with this paper, which discusses about a Buddhist statue as a device for a prayer to perceive the invisible presence. Thus, the Buddhist imagery has such a function of mediator between the invisible holy being and human beings.

This function is further enhanced by the material of the Buddhist statue. As we have already seen, the "*Eleven-headed Kannon Incantation Mind Sutra*" teaches that a "divine Incantation" is established when a statue of *Kannon* is made from Sandalwood. The "*Ghiso*" explains that if sandalwood is not available, the statue should be made of "*Kashiwa*" wood. It has already been pointed out that this word of "*Kashiwa*" was applied to "*Kaya (Japanese torreyia)*" in then Japan,<sup>31</sup> and it has recently been revealed that the majority of Japanese wood sculptures of the 8th and 9th centuries were made from "*Kaya*".<sup>32</sup>

Ancient people regarded that the matter of material as a requirement for enhancement of the statue's function. Any movement attached to a Buddhist statue made of *Danboku (Danzo)* or *Kashiwa* is related to the function of such statue as a mediator between the invisible holy being and human beings.

*Ghiso* questioned "what is the reason for the statue to move and emit the voice, even if the wood has no heart." Here, we can recognize the awareness that the statue is just a tree. The similar conception can also be found in *Nihon Ryoiki (Record of Miraculous Events in Japan)*. In the 26th episode of the middle volume, the author Keikai (active in *Nara* period) says of a statue placed at the Muraoka-dō Hall located in Koshibe village, Yoshino province, "although the tree has no

---

30 Inoue, "On the Expression of the Eleven-headed Kannon."

31 Yoshihiro Suzuki, "Kashiwa-gi Zo and Dan Zo Sculptures," *Bijutsushi (Art History)* 107 (1979).

32 Hiroaki Kaneko, Mitsuharu Iwasa, Shuichi Noshiro and Tomoyuki Fujii, "Wood Species and Views on their Usage for Wood Sculptures in Ancient Japan: Focusing on the 7th and 8th Centuries," *Museum* 555 (1998), and ibidem, "Wood Species and Views on their Usage for Wood Sculptures in Ancient Japan: Focusing on the 8th and 9th Centuries," *Museum* 583 (2003).

mind how can it emit a voice?” In the 28th episode of the last volume, he says, “the Buddha does not present in body. How can any pain and illness happen to such existent? Known truly, it is the manifestation of the Sacred Mind.” In both cases, Keikai emphasizes the “Holy Spirit” and “Sacred Mind,” and sees the statues as nothing more than a medium for spiritual experiences. We can confirm that even in ancient Japan, Buddhist statues were seen as a medium to connect humans with the invisible. Therefore, we can safely say that the representations of wind have a function of giving religious meanings to the Buddhist imagery as any media.

### 3. Wind in Japanese religious paintings

#### (1) Wind in *Kichijo-ten* imagery

As mentioned above, the representations of wind in *Danzo* sculptures (such as the Eleven-headed *Kannon* statue of Hokke-ji Temple) can be interpreted in terms of functions of the statues. This interpretation is based on the premise of a resonant relationship in which the Buddha resonates to petitions from human beings. This perspective can be applied to paintings. Next, let us consider this issue by taking up *Kichijo-ten*.

A well-known Nara-period sculptural image of *Kichijo-ten* is a plastic statue from Todai-ji Temple [Fig. 11]. This statue was the principal object of the *Kichijo-do* Hall at Todai-ji Temple. Nara-period statues of *Kichijo-ten* have also been handed down at Horyu-ji Temple [Fig. 12] and Saidai-ji Temple [Fig. 13].

These sculptures of *Kichijo-ten* are unique in that they do not depict much motion and their facial expressions are solemn. In contrast, the painted image of *Kichijo-ten* at Yakushi-ji Temple (the oldest known painting of *Kichijo-ten* in Japan) [Fig. 14] has a jewel ball on its left hand, which seems to be moving from left to right, and the sash of its robe flutters backward in the slight breeze blowing from the front. The face, with its long-slit eyes and full cheeks, is soft and gentle, and the collar of the robe reveals a glamorous cleavage. Thus, there is a great difference in the quality of expression between sculpture and painting, even though the object (*Kichijo-ten*: the goddess of good fortune) is the same.

In the latter half of the Nara period (710–94), during the reign of Emperor *Shoutoku* (718–70, reign:764–70), there were high expectations for *Kichijo-ten*, who was entrusted to bring about increases in wealth and grain production. In spiritual resonance to these expectations, a *Kichijo* Repentance was held at Kokubun-ji Temple for seven days, starting on the eighth day of the first month of the first year of Jingo-Keiun (767).<sup>33</sup> In addition, an article in *Shoku Nihongi* dated August

---

33 “Article on January (8), Jingo-Keiun 1 (767),” in *Shoku-Nihongi*.

16 of the same year<sup>34</sup> states that a New Year's lecture on the *Saisho-o Sutra* was given at court and that the *Kichijo* Repentance was held there at the same time. This is thought to have been the beginning of the *Misaie*, which became a regular event during the *Heian* period (794–1185).

Based on the *Golden Light (Konkoumyo) Saisho-o Sutra* (hereafter referred to as *Saisho-o Sutra*), the *Kichijo* Repentance is a ritual to repent before a statue of the goddess *Kichijo-ten* and pray for the fulfillment of one's wishes. In the *Golden Light Saisho-o Sutra*, vol. 8: "Great *Kichijo* Goddess increasing Property and Goods,"<sup>35</sup> it is written, "You must purify one room and paint the ground with *Quma*. In spiritual resonance, I shall paint an image of myself, and with the help of various kinds of paintings, I shall adorn the entire region of the Buddha's shrine."<sup>36</sup> The instructions for using a painting as the principal object of worship are described, but there were also instances in which statues were used as the principal object of worship. The manners of worshippers are: "Wash and bathe yourself, put on clean clothes, apply fragrant incense, enter the purified room, and at three o'clock every day, from the heart, call out the name of the Buddha and the title of this sutra for my sake, and pay me your respects," and "At dawn, first polish your teeth with a piece of wood, rinse your mouth clean, and after nursing, offer incense and flowers to all Buddhas. Then, tell us your sins, and for the sake of your own body and all other beings, turn and pray for the speedy fulfillment of what you desire"; "Set up a throne of victory, and solemnize it with a banner and cover, and arrange various flowers and ornaments on the altar. I must be completely devoted to the previous incantation and hope to attain my coming." So, they instruct to purify yourselves, recite the name of the Buddha, repent, and pray for the coming of *Kichijo-ten*. It then goes on to say, "At that time, I shall observe this person in remembrance, enter his room, sit on his throne, and receive his offerings. From this time onward, he will be able to see me in his sleep-dreams." Like this, the prayer can receive the coming of *Kichijo-ten* and see her in its dream. The coming of *Kichijo-ten* brings increased wealth and prosperity.

A ceremony called *Kichijo Gogan* was held at the *Kichijo* Hall of *Todai-ji* Temple,<sup>37</sup> which is considered to correspond to the *Kichijo* Repentance, and the statue of *Kichijo-ten* at *Todai-ji*

---

34 "Article on August (16), Jingo-Keiun 1 (767)," in *Shoku Nihongi*.

35 *Taishōzō* 16–439b. The transcription here is based on Mibu Daishun, *Butten Koza 13 Konkōmyōkyō* (Lecture on the Buddhist Scriptures 13: The Golden Light Sutra) (Tokyo: Daizōshuppan, 1977).

36 "Article on August 22, Genkei 1 (877)," *Sandai Jitsuroku*: "I have been told by the government of *Izumo*. On the 24th day of the first month of the second year of the Jingo-Keiun era, a painting of *Kichijo-ten* was placed at the *Kokubun-ji* Temple. Every year, a ritual had been held in front of it and it was gradually damaged after a long period of time. In the thirteenth year of the Jōgan era, the monk Yakumi, a lecturer of *Den-Tomani*, transformed the painting to a wooden statue of five *shaku* high."

37 "Article on *Kichijo-do* Hall (Chapter 4, Shoin)," in *Todai-ji Yōroku*, vol. 4,

Temple is thought to have been the principal object of the ceremony of the *Kichijo* Repentance. It is highly possible that the statues at Horyu-ji Temple and Saidai-ji Temple were also the principal worship objects of the *Kichijo* Repentance. On the other hand, the painted image of *Kichijo-ten* from Yakushi-ji Temple has descended to the Chinju (local deity) Hachimangu Shrine (Kyugaoka Hachimangu Shrine) as a secret Buddha image and was considered the principal image of the *Kichijo* Repentance ceremony held there during the New Year days,<sup>38</sup> so this is another example related to *Kichijo* Repentance.

Although these sculptures and the painting of *Kichijo-ten* are considered to be the principal images of the *Kichijo* Repentance, there is a significant difference in the quality of expression found in them. Wind is expressed only in the painted image of *Kichijo-ten*. The significance of this difference is easier to understand if we assume the difference in function between sculpture and painting. The rite of *Kichijo* Repentance, like other Buddhist rites, is composed of human action, which is the cause, and the spiritual resonance from the gods and Buddha, which is the fruit. In the case of *Kichijo* Repentance, the human actions of recitation of the Buddha's name in prayer, penitence, and hope for *Kichijo-ten*'s coming lead to its arrival and the fulfillment of the increase in wealth and prosperity. It is thought that sculptures and paintings of *Kichijo-ten* played respectively either function of these two phases of the ritual. In other words, the sculptural image of *Kichijo-ten* was created in a solemn expression as the object of a human act of penance, while the painted image of *Kichijo-ten* is an illusion of her coming and the fulfillment of the prayer for her.<sup>39</sup> The movement of painted *Kichijo-ten* signifies her coming and the jewel ball on her left hand signifies the fulfillment of prayers, respectively. Thus, the wind of the *Kichijo-ten* also signifies her coming.

In the case of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* repentance, it is thought that the sculpture became the principal object of worship according to the instruction to create a Buddhist statue, written in the *Eleven-headed Kannon Incantation Mind Sutra*. The representation of wind seen in the statue of the Eleven-headed *Kannon* of Hokke-ji Temple was meant to stand for the fulfillment of a prayer. In the case of the *Kichijo* Repentance, on the other hand, the functions of sculpture and painting are divided. The painting represents the fulfillment of the prayer. Principally, painting is a medium

---

38 Kosei Taniguchi, "National Treasure: Mabu-Chakushoku *Kichijo-ten zo*," in Nara National Museum and National Research Institute for Cultural Properties, Tokyo, eds., *National Treasure: Mabu-Chakushoku Kichijo-ten-zo* (Tokyo: National Research Institute for Cultural Properties, 2008); Kose Taniguchi, "Commentary on *Kichijo-ten-zo*," in *Tōdai-ji, Shōsōin and Kofuku-ji*, Nihon Bijutsu Zenshu 2 (Tokyo: Shogakukan, 2013).

39 Takeo Izumi proposes a hypothesis that this image might be what appeared in a dream. Takeo Izumi, "On Yakushi-ji *Kichijo-ten-zo*," in *National Treasure, Advent of Kichijo-Goddess in Yakushi-ji Temple, Nara: Prayers for the Future* (Sendai: Sendai City Museum, 2015).

suitable for illusion. It is conceivable that the function of such a medium was actively sought based on description in the *Saisho-o Sutra*, which instructs worshipers to make a painting.

The seven-day *Kichijo* Repentance starting on the eighth day of the New Year had continued into the Heian period (794–1185), and in some cases the venue for the ritual meeting was moved from the Kokubun-ji Temple to the *Kokucho* (the national government office). On the same schedule, the Daigoku-den Hall of the Imperial Palace held a *Gosaie*, in which the *Saisho-o Sutra* was preached during the daytime and the *Kichijo* Repentance was performed in the evening.

According to the *Engi-shiki*, the principal objects for *Gosaie* in the Heian period (794–1185) were *Danzo* statues of *Vairocana* and *Bodhisattva* attendants in a miniature shrine.<sup>40</sup> The reason why the principal image for the ritual based on the *Saisho-o Sutra* is here of the *Vairocana*, which has no direct relation to the sutra, is not so far efficiently explained. Yet, I think it is because its presence reflects the view that “this world” in which *Kichijo-ten* exists is enveloped in the sphere of *Vairocana*, namely the *Rengezou Sekai* (*kusuma-tala-garbha-vyūhālaṃkāra-loka-dhātu-samudra*, or Lotus Housing World).<sup>41</sup> The year of Jingo-Keiun 1 (767), when the *Gosaie* began, was just after the construction of the Great *Buddha* statue of *Vairocana* at the Todai-ji Temple, a truly appropriate time for such a view to be born. This viewpoint is fundamental to the worldview of the Heian period and needs to be more deeply explained, but since it is beyond the scope of this paper, I will not go into it further here.

## (2) Wind revealing the *suijaku* (tentative presence of *Buddha* or *Bodhisattva*)

As described above, winds represented in the Buddhist art are symbols that signal the spiritual resonance of *Buddhas* and *Bodhisattvas* to human prayers. In the *Renshou* stupas, wind was represented to stand for the spiritual resonance to offerings for *Buddha*'s reliquary; in the Eleven-headed *Kannon* repentance, wind was used to represent the auspicious spiritual resonance to the recitative prayer of *darani*; and in the *Kichijo* repentance, wind was rendered to reflect the coming of *Kichijo-ten*, who responded to the repentance. Wind is considered to have such meanings and so

---

40 *Engi-shiki*, vol. 13: “Zushoryo,” in *Koutai-shiki, Kounin-hiki and Engi-shiki*, Shintei Zouho Kokushi Taikai, vol. 26.

41 My previously published articles related to the *Rengezou Sekai* (the Lotus Housing World) are as follows. Ryusaku Nagaoka, “The Lotus Housing World and *Kannon*,” in *Currents in Kegon Culture*, Essays of the Great Buddha Symposium 10 (2012); Ryusaku Nagaoka, “The Lotus Housing World and the Folding Screen from the Shōsōin,” in *Functional Theory-Making, Using, and Transmitting*, Buddhist Art Essays 5 (Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2014); Ryusaku Nagaoka, “The Significance and Formation of ‘Heaven’ in Todai-ji Temple in the Nara Period,” in *Thought and Culture of Todai-ji Temple*, New Studies on Todai-ji Temple, vol. 3. (Kyoto: Hozokan, 2018); Ryusaku Nagaoka, *Buddhism and Formation*, Part II, Chapters 2 and 3.

represented. Japanese Shinto deities also appear with wind. An example of this can be seen in the *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E* (Pictural records of the appearance of the Shinto deity *Kasuga Gongen*).

In the seventh section of volume 8 of the *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E*, the figure of *Kasuga Daimyōjin* (=Gongen) appears before a former monk of the Kofuku-ji Temple, who was living in the distant Kanto region [Fig. 15]. *Daimyōjin*, dressed in a *sokutai*, is seen in shadow (appears in this world) between maple trees with autumn leaves on the left and pine trees on the right, facing toward the right. The hem of his lower garment is long and swept to the left, and above and below it auspicious clouds are trailing to the left. In front of the deity, a monk sits with embracing his knees in a tatami-mat-paved room with thatched roof surrounded by the porch, but he does not seem to be aware of this miracle. In addition, there are a hand-wash basin at the edge of the porch, a handkerchief hanging from a pine branch, a bamboo fence in angle-shaped framing the realm of the deity's presence in shadow (appearance in this world), autumn grasses growing around it, and in the distance, a distant mountain with gently undulating ridges and a half-moon appearing at its edge.

The inscription of verses of this section reads as follows.<sup>42</sup>

One day, as the moonlight was bright and clear in the autumn evening, I was in tears as I contemplated the presence of the *Kasuga no Mihozen*, and without a dream or manifestation, the Great *Myōjin* flew on in his noble form. Even if you become a person who lives far from my shrine, I won't leave you and think of you as a child despite of any rank as you have once lived for a while in my shrine. The same will be true in your afterlife.

What is noteworthy about these verses is that they seem to have no similarity with the Buddhist examples we have seen so far. This is because the appearance of *Daimyōjin* is not necessarily realized in accordance with the principle of cause and effect. The only reason for the appearance of *Daimyōjin* before the monk is that he used to live in Kofuku-ji Temple, and the monk is not performing the act of inviting the deity's presence in shadow (this world). Therefore, this appearance cannot be considered to have occurred in the context of a resonant relationship between God or Buddha and human beings. The fact that the monk does not seem to be aware of God's presence also indicates that he is not guiding the deity's presence in shadow (this world).

The only motif depicted mainly in the painting that also appears in the lyrics, other than the deity *Daimyōjin* and the monk, is the moon. Thus, we can see that the moon is one of the main

---

42 Shigemi Komatsu, ed., *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E*, vol. Jō, *Shoku Nihon Emaki Taisei* 14, (Tokyo: Chuokoronsha, 1982).

motives that gives meaning to this scene. What, then, does the moon signify? We can find out by looking at the verses at the beginning of this picture scroll. It reads as follows

*Kasuga no Daimyōjin* is equivalent of the *Nyorai* (tathagata) of the full moon and full enlightenment, who softens the light of the *kuonjodo* (the eternal path for completion), and the Tokaku in hierarchy (one of highest status of Bodhisattva), who hides the shadow of the nature of true ground. As the faithful deity of a single dynasty, he always protects the peace of the four seas.

In the *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E*, the moon is a symbol of *Nyorai*, the true ground of *Kasuga Daimyōjin*.<sup>43</sup> The fact that *Daimyōjin* appeared on a moonlit night speaks of the mechanism of the manifestation of *Nyorai* as *Daimyōjin*. Thus, this scene is meant to visualize the mechanism of *honji-suijaku* as a manifestation. It should be noted that the moon is above the distant mountain. The only possible mountain on which *Daimyōjin*'s true ground could be located is Mount Kasuga in Nara. In the verses of the fourth section of volume 8, when the monk Ichiwa, after leaving Kofuku-ji Temple, offers *dharma* alms at the Owari *Atsuta* Shrine, *Daimyōjin* appears in the form of a mysterious holy man and calls himself “the old bone of Mount Kasuga,” which also indicates that *Daimyōjin*'s headquarters is at Mount Kasuga. As the Mount Kasuga is depicted in the distant background, the scene is considered to depict the *Daimyōjin*, who is based on distant Mount Kasuga, manifests his presence in the Kanto region. The Mount Kasuga in the volume 19 [Fig. 16], which, like this scene, is depicted as a mountain with gently undulating ridges.

And the wind represents the deity's presence. While the hem of his lower garment is long swept but the handkerchief hanging from the pine tree at the edge of the porch does not move at all. This scene also tells us that the wind that is blowing the hem of the garment is not natural.

Another example of the implied wind accompanying the presence of *Kasuga no Daimyōjin* is the *Kasuga Shika Mandala* [Fig. 17] in the Yomei Bunko collection. This painting depicts a deer, the vehicle of *Daimyōjin*, and a twig of *Sakaki* tree standing on its saddle in the foreground; pine trees, maple trees, and cherry trees in the middle ground; and three mountains, the Mikasa, the Wakakusa and the Kasuga, in the background, with a celestial image (considered to be the moon) appearing above the Kasuga Mountain. In other words, although the deity *Daimyōjin* itself is not

---

43 The *Enmei* (round and clear) of the full moon *Enmei* is discussed in Moritoshi Sasaki, “On the Placement of the Getsurin within a Statue,” *Bukkyo Geijutsu*, no. 6 (2021). For the discussion of its meaning in terms of Buddhist body, see Ryusaku Nagaoka, “The spiritual resonance from Buddha and Buddhist sculptures-On the representation of Buddhism Body,” *Booklet 29*, (Tokyo: Keio Art Center of Keio University, 2022).

depicted, the five *shidares* (paper droops) descending from the Sakaki sway slightly in the wind, suggesting the presences of the five deities of Kasuga Taisha Shrine.

On the *Shikishi*-type square seen on the upper part of the screen, the inscription of eulogy reads, “To protect the teachings of the *Hosso* sect, the deity of *Kasuga* transformed itself to the *Sakaki* and departed from *Kashima* Shrine on a deer. In order to pity the learned priests of Kofuku-ji Temple, he became a manifestation of himself in the village of Kasuga. The main body of the deity is *Rushana Kuon Sei Shokaku* (the principal *Vairocana Buddha* attained eternal enlightenment as *Shakyamuni*), and he manifested himself as the Great *Myojin* in order to help the believers go over to another world”. This *Rushana Kuon Sei Shokaku* expresses the same meaning as that of *Mangetsu Enmei no Nyorai* found in the *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E*. In other words, as in the case of *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E*, the celestial image (the moon) appearing in the background at the edge of Mt. Kasuga symbolizes the true ground *Nyorai*. The wind represents the manifestation of this *Nyorai* as the deity.

From the two scenes in both *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E* and *Kasuga Shika Mandala*, it is clear that the same deity appears sometimes realistically in a human figure, and is sometimes present with a subtle suggestion. In both cases, however, it is highly noteworthy that the wind symbolizes both.

A similar suggestive representation of wind can be found in the Christian theme of the Annunciation. In Antonello da Messina’s (c. 1430–79) “Madonna of Annunciation” [Fig. 18], the archangel Gabriel is not present in the scene to announce the conception, although he is necessary for this theme. Instead, the pages of the Bible that Mary is reading appear to move slightly. One of commentaries focuses on the light shining on Mary,<sup>44</sup> but the subtle movement of the pages may also be indicative of divine revelation. If so, this, too, is a motif, whose holiness is implied by wind.

### Conclusions

As we have seen above, the representation of wind in religious art has the meaning and function of a sign presented to human beings by the superior beings. When a worshipper communes with the superior, wind mediates the communication. In this sense, wind has no meaning in itself. The representation of wind has no meaning without context.

As mentioned at the beginning of this article, I have currently the view that art is essential to religion. This view leads readers to think of art in terms of religion. In other words, when considering Buddhist art, the framework of worship, which presupposes the existence of superior

---

44 Stephen J. Campbell and Michael W. Cole, *A Compendium of Italian Renaissance Art 1, 1400–1500*, trans. (Tokyo, Shōfusha, 2014).

beings, such as *Buddhas* and *Bodhisattvas*, is seems to be indispensable. Buddhist statues and arts have meanings and functions in connecting human beings and the superior beings. Art is what makes the invisible superior perceived by human beings in some ways. In this sense, wind is a good player to convey the presence of the superior to the human beings. The purpose of this paper was to confirm one way how the superior could be present.

However, the meaning of wind in religion does not lie only here. As we have already seen, there were some instances of the spiritual resonance from the *Renshou Stūpa* project, in which winds were considered as obstacles. In these cases, winds themselves were obstacles, and had such meanings. Such winds are symbolized by the deity *Fujin* (wind god).

Concerning this matter, Nene Koike newly discovered that the deity *Raijin* (thunder god) depicted in the fourth section of vol. 1, of the *Genjo-Sanzo E.* has the meaning of disaster.<sup>45</sup> This discovery was significant, as it led Koike conclude that the *Genjo-Sanzo E* contains a belief in *Kannon*, the Goddess of Mercy, who could eliminate disasters.

Similarly, it would be useful to consider the representation of wind from the perspective of the wind or wind gods, who symbolizes calamity. How would the wind be represented then? Supposedly, it will take a form appropriate to the meaning of disaster. However, my interest does not extend to such questions at this time, because I don't want to question the meaning attached to the iconography itself. When the iconography of wind symbolizing calamity is expected to become a material for considering the relationship between human beings and the superior, as Koike has suggested, I would like to think about this issue again.

[Fig. 1] The statue of Eleven-headed *Kannon* statue, early *Heian* period, 9th century, wood, height 100 cm, Hokke-ji Temple, Nara.

[Fig. 2] The statue of *Kokūzō Bosatsu*, early *Heian* period, 9th century, wood, height 51.5 cm, Daigo-ji Temple, Kyoto.

[Fig. 3] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the South side of lid's risers. Sui dynasty, 4th year of *Renshou* (604), stone, Body: height: 119 cm, width: 109 cm, depth, 109 cm; Lid: height: 52 cm, width: 109 cm, depth, 109 cm, former Yao County Museum, Shaanxi province.

[Fig. 4] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the North side of lid's risers.

[Fig. 5] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the East side of lid's risers.

[Fig. 6] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the West side of lid's risers.

[Fig. 7] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the South face of body.

---

45 Nene Koike, "A Short Consideration on the "Genjo Sanzo Picture" in the Fujita Museum Collection; Focusing on the *Kannon*-Worships seen in the Words of the Inscription and the Images of the Painting," *Bijutsushi-gaku* 42 (2021).

- [Fig. 8] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the North face of body.
- [Fig. 9] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the East face of body.
- [Fig. 10] The stone coffin of *sarira* of the Shéndé Temple, Rubbing of the West face of body.
- [Fig. 11] The statue of standing *Kichijo-ten*, *Nara* period, 8th century, plaster figure, height: 202 cm, Hokke-do, Todaiji-Temple, Nara.
- [Fig. 12] The statue of standing *Kichijo-ten*, *Nara* period, 8th century, plaster figure, height: 168.3 cm, Horyuji-Temple, Nara.
- [Fig. 13] The statue of standing *Kichijo-ten*, *Nara* period, 8th century, wood-core dry lacquer figure, height: 184.3 cm, Saidaiji-Temple, Nara.
- [Fig. 14] The painting of *Kichijo-ten*, *Nara* period, 8th century, colored linen, 53.2 x 32 cm, Yakushiji-Temple, Nara.
- [Fig. 15] “The figure of *Kasuga Daimyōjin* appears before a former *Kofuku-ji* priest living in the Kanto region,” The volume 8 of *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E*, *Kamakura* period, 2nd year of *Enkei* (1309), colored silk, 41.2 x 983.7 cm, Sannomaru Shozokan, Tokyo.
- [Fig. 16] “The Mount Kasuga.” The volume 19 of *Kasuga-Gongen-Kenki E*, 2nd year of *Enkei* (1309), colored silk, Sannomaru Shozokan, Tokyo.
- [Fig. 17] *Kasuga Shika Mandala*, *Kamakura* period, 13th century, colored silk, 137.6 x 52.9 cm, Yomei-bunko, Kyoto.
- [Fig. 18] Antonello da Messina, *Madonna of Annunciation*, c. 1476, oil on wood, 45 x 34.5 cm, Galleria Regionale della Sicilia, Palermo.

---

Ryusaku Nagaoka

Professor of Eastern and Japanese Art History

University of Tohoku